## **Foreword**

Antonio Sergio Guimarães

David Lehmann's book appears at a very opportune moment: it can be read in detail, providing food for careful reflection, or more quickly for those seeking a rapid overview of its subject. If I may go straight to the point, however, what struck me most forcefully in Lehmann's argument was his "structural" explanation for the adoption of race quotas in Brazil.

Seen from a traditionalist point of view, quotas present a paradox. In the early 1990s an electoral victory by Lula was nothing more than a utopian fantasy in left-wing circles, not least because it contained within itself a contradiction: not only was Lula seen to be ill-prepared for the office of president, having refused to stand for election to the Chamber of Deputies, but also the Partido dos Trabalhadores (PT) itself showed little interest in exercising power, having avoided any electoral alliances and even refusing to sign the Constitution of 1988. Likewise, even in the mid-1990s, affirmative action and multiculturalism seemed to belong to an unfamiliar international agenda, far removed from Brazilian traditions, as both social democrats and PT supporters did not fail to point out. In 1996, therefore, it was unthinkable that the country might start adopting race quotas as early as 2003.

The paradox lies precisely in the speed with which a seemingly unthinkable agenda came to be not only discussed but also implemented in a space of seven years. What can explain the capitulation of the Brazilian state to pressure from such a small group? What can explain the fact that public opinion itself moved so quickly, first taking Lula to the presidency and then accepting race quotas in the face of the almost unanimous opposition of the main news outlets and leading intellectuals?

In this book David Lehmann proposes a promising reply to the first question: the institutional structure of the Brazilian state, heir to a history of corporatism and perpetual recompositions of elite interests, and always on the lookout for ways to accommodate emerging social forces, enabled it, in his view, to come to terms with demands coming from organized sectors of popular movements and the movimento negro. What Antonio Gramsci called *trasformismo*—the absorption of representatives of the oppressed classes via the political system—is in this view an institutional arrangement peculiar to the Brazilian state that exists for the purpose of dampening conflicts and reaching accommodations between emerging social forces and more traditional sectors.

But how to explain the shift in public opinion? On this point the facts and arguments presented by Lehmann must be followed carefully, for they call for constant reflection on the part of the reader, because, although he provides all the clues, the book is open to various interpretations.

We should begin by recalling that already in the 1990s various tendencies pointed to the need to contain the growing mobilization of social forces outside the political system. We can see, first, in bills presented in the Senate and the Chamber of Deputies, that sectors of the oligarchy began to take preemptive steps toward race quotas in both higher education and the labour market. Second, a younger generation of intellectuals had already, since the 1980s, been building a new theory of Brazilian racism and the country's race relations, attacking both the "myth of racial democracy" and the "genocide of Brazil's black population." Third, after a long period of stagnation since the 1960s, the federal system of higher education was again becoming a target for the profound discontent of the middle classes, which had emerged from the rapid economic growth of the 1970s, creating broad popular support for the idea of a massive expansion of free public university education. Finally, social movements and trade unions began to produce a strong political leadership able to operate with ease in the corridors of power. Union leaders securely installed in both the public sector—mainly in education and health—and the private sector—in the metallurgical and petroleum sectors and banking-were ready to reach for the higher levels of political power.

Thus the decline in Fernando Henrique Cardoso's popularity at the end of his second period made it hard to envisage a continuation of the centre-right alliance led by the PSDB (Partido da Social Democracia Brasileira) and opened the way for a new alignment secured by the PT's victory in 2002. From then on, the accommodation of new social forces

accelerated and the organized negro movements increased their access and influence. Lehmann follows the steps of a few political figures—black activists—who occupied pivotal roles in state assemblies, universities, the judiciary, and federal ministries. Quotas could now be seen as an efficient means of advancing the interests of emerging groups while protecting those of more established ones. He also makes quite a convincing sociological argument for the use of the theory of social movements as a way to understand the organization of the quotas campaign and the relative autonomy of black organizations as they gained access to state agencies.

Another point that caught my attention in this book is the role of university leaders, mainly rectors and their staffs, in the development of quota policies—a role that would be expanded in 2008 thanks to the minister of education himself. How can one understand this leadership role in the face of the substantial power of the academic and administrative trade unions? I also want to draw readers' attention to another paradox: although they almost invariably owe their election to union support, the rectors were not captured by the "class-based" and anti-quota ideology of those unions, whose focus was almost exclusively on pressing for increased government education budgets. On the contrary, perhaps seeking an independent base for their own political leadership, the rectors, and later Lula's minister of education, Fernando Haddad, were moved to open up to the demands of the black social movement so as to create a counterweight to the unions. This shift was eased, as Lehmann explains, by a discourse based on social and racial justice, which meant that the adoption of race quotas was always accompanied by, or rather stuffed into, social quotas, thus neutralizing in one fell swoop the more radical class-driven demands of the unions and the more radical racedriven demands of the social movements. As of 2008, federal ministries, the judiciary, and other state agencies had taken over the leadership of the quotas cause, and the expansion of the federal higher education system, as well as the social and racial inclusion of the "new middle class"—the beneficiaries of the PT government's income redistribution policies—found a place at the heart of the government's project.

Through this book's fluid narrative, with its firm empirical basis and solid sociological arguments, the English-language reader will be able to follow the trajectory of a social movement—namely, the quotas campaign—which reveals the mechanics of the contemporary Brazilian state and also helps us to understand the crisis unleashed by the overthrow of the PT government in 2016.

## **Preface**

This book comes with two warnings to the reader. The first is that it is a study of a milieu of which I myself have been a member—albeit an intermittent one—for some forty years, namely, Brazilian academia. As a result I have had the good fortune to pick the brains and hear the stories of many people who would quite possibly not have responded if I had been a doctoral student at the other end of my career. This intimacy with the subject matter has also led me to write in a slightly different style than that which can be found in my work on Pentecostal churches, for example, where I am most definitely an outsider in standard ethnographic mode. The style is different both because it pays attention to the portrayal of an atmosphere and because it deals quite often with personalities, even though sometimes I hide the true identity of a source, an informant, or the holder of one or another opinion. My hope is that this makes the story more readable than it otherwise would be.

The second warning is that the book engages with some quite sensitive and controversial normative questions that have surrounded the debates about race-based quotas in the allocation of university places and public sector jobs, or affirmative actions as they are also known in Brazil. In this respect I have taken a different approach from most (though not all) writing by outsiders on race in Brazil and Spanish America, because I have listened to and considered different sides of the argument rather than declaring a partisan position at the outset. My position as an outsider has (I hope) helped me to maintain friendships even with people with whose opinions I have in the end not been able to fully agree. I am convinced that, although social scientists—local or foreign—are perfectly entitled to take openly partisan positions, to do so aggressively in their writings weakens their contribution and risks making them into

mouthpieces of local political factions. The corollary is that their scholarship may be dismissed as partisan by those in the local or international arena who disagree with them. I occasionally remark in this book that scholarly activity in Brazil and other Latin American countries is excessively shaped by political-tribal loyalties. As I argued in my introduction to the recent collective work The Crisis of Multiculturalism in Latin America (2016), it is perverse to use the recognition of inevitable ideological bias in social science as a reason for pursuing and deepening that bias; rather it should encourage us to handle it warily. But we have to be aware that the explicit and more often implicit pressures in Latin American academic life to adopt and remain faithful to one or another ideological, political, or party loyalty can be very strong. I am no more immune to these pressures than others, but I have tried to deal as impartially as I can with the normative issues raised by the quotas debate and I hope thereby to bring about further exploration of how political philosophy—of which I am far from a seasoned practitioner—can play a role in political argument in Brazil and other countries of the region.

Nonetheless, I have in the end taken a position and I have to recognize that to spend all those years studying this subject in order then, in the end, to take a position against quotas would have been very surprising, if not perverse. In those circumstances, I would probably not have written the book at all.

London, October 2017

## **Acronyms**

- ABA: Associação Brasileira de Antropologia—Brazilian Anthropological Association.
- ABI: Associação Brasileira de Imprensa—Brazilian Press Association.
- ABONG: Associação Brasileira de Organizações Não-Governamentais— Brazilian Association of NGOs.
- ABPN: Associação Brasileira de Pesquisadores/as Negros/as—Brazilian Black Researchers' Association.
- ACMUN: Associação Cultural de Mulheres Negras—Cultural Association of Black Women.
- ADPF: Argüição de Descumprimento de Preceito Fundamental—a case brought to court alleging noncompliance with a fundamental (constitutional) precept.
- ANPOCS: Associação Nacional de Pós-Graduação e Pesquisa em Ciências Sociais—Brazilian National Social Science Association.
- BID/IDB: Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo—Interamerican Development Bank.
- BNDES: Banco Nacional de Desenvolvimento Econômico e Social— National Social and Economic Development Bank.
- CCN: Conselho da Comunidade Negra—Council for the Black Community.
- CEA: Centro de Estudos Afro-Asiáticos Centre of African and Asian Studies.
- CEAO: Centro de Estudos Asiáticos e Orientais—Center for Asian and Oriental Studies, UFBA.
- CEAP: Centro de Articulação de Populações Marginalizadas—Center for the Mobilization of Marginalized Populations.
- CEB: Comunidade Eclesial de Base—Christian Base Community.

- CEBRAP: Centro Brasileiro de Análise e Planejamento—Brazilian Centre for Analysis and Planning.
- CEERT: Centro de Estudos das Relações de Trabalho e Desigualdade— Centre for Labour and Inequality Studies.
- CEPPIR: Coordenadoria Especial de Políticas de Promoção da Igualdade Racial—Special Coordinating Body for Racial Equality.
- CHESF: Companhia Hidrelétrica do São Francisco—São Francisco Hydroelectric Corporation.
- CIEC: Coordenação Interdisciplinar de Estudos Culturais— Interdisciplinary Cultural Studies Committee.
- CNE: Conselho Nacional de Educação—National Education Council.
- CNPq: Conselho Nacional de Pesquisas—National Research Council.
- CONAPIR: Conferencia Nacional de Promoção da Igualdade Racial— National Conference for the Promotion of Racial Equality.
- CRIOLA: an NGO devoted to women's health. This is not an acronym but a term meaning "a black woman" or maybe "a woman of dark skin."
- CSO: civil society organization.
- CUT: Central Unica dos Trabalhadores—National Trade Union Central—the dominant peak trade union body.
- ENADE: Exame Nacional de Desempenho de Estudantes—National Student Progress Examination.
- ENEM: Exame Nacional do Ensino Médio—National Secondary School Examination.
- ESAF: Espaços Afirmados—Spaces of Affirmation.
- FASE: Federação de Órgãos para Assistência Social e Educacional— Federation of Agencies for Social and Educational Assistance.
- FGV: Fundação Getúlio Vargas—Getúlio Vargas Foundation.
- FIES: Fundo de Financiamento Estudantil—Student Finance Fund.
- FNB: Frente Negra Brasileira—Brazilian Black Front.
- FUNAI: Fundação Nacional do Indio—National Indian Foundation—the state agency charged with protection of the indigenous population.
- FUVEST: Fundação Universitária para o Vestibular—University Foundation for the Management of the Vestibular Examination (in São Paulo).
- GELEDES Instituto da Mulher Negra—GELEDES Black Women's Institute.
- GEMAA: Grupo de Estudos Multidisciplinar da Ação Afirmativa— Multidisciplinary Research Group on Affirmative Actions.
- GPA: grade point average.

- IBASE: Instituto Brasileiro de Análise Social y Económica—Brazilian Institute for Social and Economic Analysis.
- IBGE: Instituto Brasileiro de Geografía e Estatística—Brazilian Geography and Statistics Institute.
- IESP: Instituto de Estudos Sociais e Políticos—Institute for Social and Political Research (at UERJ).
- IFCS: Instituto de Filosofia e Ciências Sociais (Institute of Philosophy and Social Sciences, Federal University of Rio de Janeiro)
- IFP: International Fellowship Program.
- IFPE: Instituto Federal de Pernambuco—Pernambuco Federal Education Institute.
- IIDH: Instituto Interamericano de Derechos Humanos—Interamerican Institutute of Human Rights.
- ILO: International labour Organization.
- IMENA: Instituto de Mulheres Negras do Amapá—Amapá Black Women's Institute.
- INCLUSP: Programa de Inclusão Social na Universidade de São PauloUSP Social Inclusion Programme.
- INCRA: Instituto Nacional de Colonização e Reforma Agrária— National Agrarian Reform Institute.
- INEP: Instituto Nacional de Estudos e Pesquisas Educacionais Anísio Teixeira—National Institute of Educational Research—named for Anisio Teixeira, an educator whose death during the military dictatorship has never been clarified.
- IPEA: Instituto de Pesquisa Econômica Aplicada—Institute for Applied Economic Research.
- ISB: Instituto Cultural Steve Biko—Steve Biko Cultural Institute.
- Itamaraty: shorthand for Ministry of Foreign Affairs (named after the palace in Rio de Janeiro where the Ministry was housed until its move to Brasilia).
- IUPERJ: Instituto Universitário de Pesquisas do Rio de Janeiro— University Research Institute of Rio de Janeiro.
- LAESER: Laboratório de Análises Econômicas, Históricas, Sociais, e Estatística das Relações Raciais (Laboratory for Economic, Historical, Social, and Statistical Analysis of Race Relations).
- LPS: Laboratório de Pesquisa Social—Social Research Laboratory.
- MEC: Ministério da Educação—Ministry of Education.
- MNU: Movimento Negro Unificado contra a Discriminação Racial— United Black Antiracial Discrimination Movement.
- MPB: Musica Popular Brasileira—literally Brazilian Popular Music.

"The Prism of Race The Politics and Ideology of Affirmative: Action in Brazil"

XX David Lehmann

Foreword by Antonio Sergio Guimarães

Term used to refer to a generation of singers and musicians who flourished in the 1960s and 1970s.

MST: Movimento dos Trabalhadores Rurais Sem Terra—Landless Workers' Movement.

NEAB: Núcleo de Estudos Afro-Brasileiros—Afro-Brazilian Studies Centre.

NGO: Nongovernmental organization.

NUER: Nucleo de Estudos Etnico-Raciais—Ethnic-Racial Research Centre.

OAB: Ordem dos Advogados do Brasil—Brazilian Bar Association.

PASUSP: Programa de Avaliação Seriada da Universidade de São Paulo—Continuous Assessment Admissions Programme of São Paulo University.

PCdoB: Partido Comunista do Brasil—Communist Party of Brazil.

PDU: Programa Diversidade na Universidade—Diversity in the University Programme.

PESB: Pesquisa Social Brasileira—Brazilian Social Survey.

PET: Programa de Educação Tutorial—Tutorial Guidance Programme (for selected students in need).

PIC: Programa Inovador de Cursos—Innovative Course Programme.

PMDB: Partido do Movimento Democrático do Brasil—Brazilian Democratic Movement Party.

PNAD: Pesquisa Nacional de Amostra Domiciliar—National Household Sample Survey.

PNAES: Plano Nacional de Assistência Estudiantil—National Plan for Student Financial Support.

PNDH: Programa Nacional de Direitos Humanos—National Human Rights Programme.

POMPA: Projeto Mentes e Portas Abertas—"Open Minds and Open Doors" Project (Steve Biko Institute).

PPCor: Programa Políticas da Cor na Educação Brasileira—Programme on Colour Policies in Brazilian Education.

ProUni: Programa Universidade para Todos—University for All Programme.

PSDB: Partido da Social Democracia Brasileira—Brazilian Social Democratic Party.

PSol: Partido Socialismo e Liberdade—Socialism and Freedom Party.

PT: Partido dos Trabalhadores—Workers' Party.

PUC: Pontifícia Universidade Católica—Pontifical Catholic University. There are several in Brazil, each of them independent.

- PVC: Prevestibular Comunitario—Community-Based Prevestibular Course.
- PVN: Prevestibular para Negros Prevestibular Course for Black Students
- PVNC: Prevestibular para Negros e Carentes—Prevestibular Course for Black and Low-Income Students.
- SAT: Scholastic Aptitude Test.
- SECAD: Secretaria de Educação Continuada, e Alfabetização (later SECADI: Secretaria de Educação Continuada, Alfabetização, Diversidade e Inclusão)—Secretariat for Continuous Education, Literacy Training and—later—Diversity.
- SEDH: Secretaria Especial dos Direitos Humanos—Special Secretariat for Human Rights.
- SENUN: Seminario Nacional de Universitarios Negros—National Black Students' Seminar.
- SEPM: Secretaria Especial de Políticas para as Mulheres—Special Secretariat for Women.
- SEPPIR: Secretaría Especial de Políticas de Promoção da Igualde Racial—Special Secretariat for Racial Equality Policies.
- SEPROMI: Secretaria de Promoção da Igualdade—State Secretariat for the Promotion of Racial Equality (in Bahia).
- SISU: Sistema de Seleção Unificada—Unified Selection System.
- TEN: Teatro Experimental do Negro—Black Experimental Theatre.
- UEMS: Universidade Estadual de Mato Grosso do Sul—State University of Matto Grosso do Sul,
- UENF: Universidade Estadual do Norte Fluminense— State University of Northern Rio de Janeiro.
- UEPB: Universidade Estadual da Paraiba—State University of Paraiba.
- UERJ: Universidade Estadual do Rio de Janeiro—State University of Rio de Janeiro.
- UFAl: Universidade Federal de Alagoas—Federal University of Alagoas.
- UFBA: Universidade Federal da Bahia—Federal University of Bahia.
- UFCG: Universidade Federal de Campina Grande—Federal University of Campina Grande.
- UFMG: Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais—Federal University of Minas Gerais.
- UFPE: Universidade Federal de Pernambuco—Federal University of Pernambuco.
- UFRJ: Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro—Federal University of Rio de Janeiro.

UFRPE: Universidade Federal Rural de Pernambuco—Federal Rural University of Pernambuco.

UFSC: Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina—Federal University of Santa Catarina.

UFSCar: Universidade Federal de São Carlos—Federal University of São Carlos.

UnB: Universidade de Brasilia—University of Brasilia.

UNE: União Nacional de Estudantes—National Students' Union.

UNEB: Universidade Estadual da Bahia—State University of Bahia.

UNESP: Universidade Estadual Paulista—Paulista State University.

UNDP: United Nations Development Programme.

UNICAMP: Universidade Estadual de Campinas—State University of Campinas.

UNILAB: Universidade da Integração Internacional da Lusofonía Afro-Brasileira—University for the International Integration of the Afro-Brazilian Lusophone (Portuguese-Speaking) World.

UNIP: Universidade Paulista—Paulista University.

UNIRIO: Universidade Federal do Estado do Rio de Janeiro—Federal University of the State of Rio de Janeiro, (not to be confused with the UFRJ or with UERJ).

USP: Universidade de São Paulo—University of São Paulo.