The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

Contents

Preface xvii

1. Main Sources and Method Followed in This Study xix
2. Other Primary Sources and Secondary Literature Used in This Study xx
3. Content, Goals, and Limitations of This Study xxiii

PART 1. ARISTARCHUS: CONTEXTS AND SOURCES

1.1. Aristarchus: Life, Sources, and Selection of Fragments 3
- 1. Aristarchus at Alexandria 3
- 2. The Aristarchean Tradition and the *Venetus A* 6
- 3. The *Scholia Maiora* to the *Iliad* and Erbse's Edition 11
- 4. Aristarchus in the Scholia 14
  - 4.1. Aristonicus at Work 15
  - 4.2. Didymus at Work 18
  - 4.3. Aristonicus versus Didymus 23
- 5. Selecting Aristarchus' Fragments for This Study 26
- 6. Words and Content in Aristarchus' Fragments 27

1.2. Aristarchus on Homer: Monographs, Editions, and Commentaries 30
- 1. Homeric Monographs 31
- 2. Editions (*Ekdoseis)* and Commentaries (*Hypomnemata)*: The Evidence 35
  - 2.1. Ammonius and the Homeric *Ekdosis* of Aristarchus 36
  - 2.2. *Ekdoseis* and *Hypomnemata*: Different Reconstructions 38
- 3. The Impact of Aristarchus' Recension on the Text of Homer 41
- 4. *Ekdoseis* and *Hypomnemata*: Some Tentative Conclusions 44

PART 2. ARISTARCHUS AT WORK

2.1. Critical Signs: The Bridge between Edition and Commentary 49
- 1. The Critical Signs (σημεῖα) Used by the Alexandrians 49

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

2. *Ekdosis*, *Hypomnema*, and Critical Signs 52
3. Homeric *Hypomnemata* on Papyrus and Critical Signs 56
4. Homeric *Ekdoseis* on Papyrus and Critical Signs 59
5. Conclusions 62
2.2. Aristarchus and Manuscript Evidence 63
1. Evidence from Didymus 65
2. Evidence from Aristonicus 72
3. Conclusions 73
2.3. Paraphrase: A Ubiquitous Interpretative Tool 76
1. Aristarchus' Direct Quotations: Lecturing with Paraphrases 78
2. Close and Loose Paraphrases 81
3. Close Paraphrases: Homer 'Translated' into Koine 82
4. Loose Paraphrases: Discussing Homeric Content 85
5. Other Uses of Paraphrases 87
6. Conclusions 89

PART 3. THE SIX PARTS OF GRAMMAR

3.0. The Six Parts of Grammar 93
3.1. Reading Aloud: The Interpretative Effort of Reading 101
1. The Philologist and the Manuscript 102
2. Reading according to the Right Vowel Quantities 103
3. A Question of Division: Interpreting the *Scriptio Continua* 105
4. A Method for Clarifying Things: Adding Accents 109
4.1. Accents and Analogy 110
4.2. Accents and Homographs 111
4.3. Accents, *Scriptio Continua*, and Syntax 113
5. Between Reading and Semantics: Choosing the Breathing 116
6. Reading Aloud: Syntax and Punctuation 117
7. Posidonius, the 'Reader' of Aristarchus 119
8. Conclusions 122
3.2.A. Interpretation of Poetic Tropes: Decoding Homer's Style and Figurative Language 124
1. Tropes and Figures 125
2. Criteria Adopted in This Chapter 126
3. Metaphor (μεταφορά) 129
4. Simile (εἰκών, ὁμοίωσις, παραβολή) 133
5. Allegory (ἀλληγορία) 138
6. Synecdoche (τὸ ὅλον ἀπὸ μέρους) 142
7. Litotes and Irony (ἐκ τοῦ ἐναντίου τὸ ἐναντίον) 144
8. Antithesis (ἀντικειμένως) 147
9. 'Side by Side' Construction (παραλλήλως, ἐκ παραλλήλου) 148

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

10. Resumption (ἐπανάληψις) 150
11. Preeminence (ἐξοχή) 153
12. Reverse Order (πρὸς τὸ δεύτερον πρότερον) 154
13. Parallel Order (πρὸς τὸ πρότερον [πρότερον]) 157
14. Hyperbaton (ὑπερβατόν) 159
15. Syllepsis (σύλληψις) 161
16. Hyperbole (ὑπερβολή) 163
17. Amplification (αὔξησις) and Suggestiveness (ἔμφασις) 164
18. Conclusions 167
3.2.B. Interpretation of Poetic Figures: Decoding Homer's Syntax 171
1. Superfluous Parts of Speech (περισσεύειν, περισσός) 175
1.1. Superfluous Prepositions 176
1.2. Superfluous Particles and Conjunctions 176
1.3. Superfluous Words Are 'Redundant' (παρέλκειν) 179
2. Ellipsis (ἐλλείπειν, ἔλλειψις) 180
2.1. Ellipsis of Articles 181
2.2. Ellipsis of Prepositions 182
3. Enallage ([ἐν]αλλάσσειν, [ἐν]αλλαγή) 185
3.1. Enallage of Articles 186
3.2. Enallage of Prepositions 188
3.3. Enallage of Case 190
3.4. Enallage of Case and Enallage, or Ellipsis, of Preposition 192
3.5. Other Enallages in Nominal Forms: Gender and Number 193
3.6. Enallage of Tense 195
3.7. Enallage of Mood 197
3.7.1. Ibycean Figure (Ἰβύκειον σχῆμα) 198
3.8. Other Enallages in Verbal Forms: Voice and Person 200
3.9. Enallages Involving Adjectives, Adverbs, Prepositions, and Particles 202
4. Figures concerning the Agreement of Subject and Predicate 203
4.1. Pindaric Figure (Πινδαρικὸν σχῆμα) 203
4.2. Plural Predicates with Neuter Plural Subjects 203
4.3. Alcmanic Figure (Ἀλκμανικὸν σχῆμα) 205
5. *Concordantia ad Sensum* (σχῆμα πρὸς τὸ νοητόν / πρὸς τὸ σημαινόμενον) 206
6. *Apo Koinou* Construction (σχῆμα ἀπὸ κοινοῦ or κοινόν) 207
6.1. *Apo Koinou* Constructions and Atheteseis 208
7. Syntactic Supplements (ἔξωθεν [προσ]ὑπακούειν/λαμβάνειν) 209
7.1. Syntactic Supplements (ἔξωθεν ἀκουστέον) and Atheteseis 212
7.2. Other Figures Requiring Syntactic/Semantic Supplements 212
8. Conclusions 213

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

3.3.A. Explanation of *Glossai*: Diving into the Microcosm of Homeric Vocabulary 217
1. Analyzing Homeric Vocabulary 219
1.1. Homer as Exegete of Himself 220
1.2. *Glossai* Clarified by the Context (σαφῶς ἐκ τῶν συμφραζομένων) 221
1.3. Clarifying Homer without Homer 225
2. Homeric Vocabulary as a Self-Sufficient Microcosm 226
2.1. Homeric Greek versus Koine 226
2.2. Homeric Greek in Line with Koine 228
2.3. Standard Meaning (κυρίως) versus Peculiar Meaning (οὐ κυρίως/ἰδίως) 229
2.4. Homeric Words with a Specific Meaning (οὐ ψιλῶς) 231
2.5. Sharp Distinctions in Homeric Vocabulary 232
2.6. Polysemous Words in Homer 236
2.7. Homeric Words with Both Active and Passive Meaning 238
2.8. Words with a Meaning Arising 'from the Consequence' (ἐκ [τοῦ] παρεπομένου /παρακολουθοῦντος) 240
2.9. Genus and Species 241
2.10. Homeric Hapax Legomena 244
2.11. Words Used Wrongly or according to Catachresis (καταχρηστικῶς) 246
3. Against the Glossographers' One-for-One (ἓν ἀνθ' ἑνός) Interpretation 247
4. Solving Problems through Homeric Vocabulary 252
4.1. Solving *Zetemata* and Perceived Narrative Inconsistencies 253
4.2. Solving Perceived Linguistic Inconsistencies 255
4.3. Choice between Variants 258
4.4. Atheteseis Due to Words Used οὐχ Ὁμηρικῶς 260
5. Conclusions 262
3.3.B. Explanation of *Historiai*: Characters, Customs, and Places of the Heroic World 265
1. 'Who Is Who' in the *Iliad* 267
1.1. Homonymy: Same Name for Different Heroes 267
1.2. Homonymy to 'Save' Homer's Consistency 269
1.3. Double Names: Same Hero with Different Names 272
2. The Heroic World 273
2.1. The Society of the *Iliad*: Heroes, Kings, and Soldiers 274
2.2. Social and Religious Rituals 275
2.3. Meals, Food, and Dining Habits 278
2.4. Clothes and Fashion 279
2.5. Money and Writing 281

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

2.6. The Dead and Their Rituals 283
2.7. Sports and Funeral Games 284
2.8. Horses and Chariots 287
2.9. Weaponry 288
2.9.1. The Armor 288
2.9.2. The Shield 291
2.9.3. The *Zetema* of the Shield of Achilles 292
2.9.4. Helmets, Swords, and Other Weapons 294
2.9.5. Arming Scenes 295
3. Homeric Geography and Ethnography 297
3.1. Homonymy: Same Name for Different Places 298
3.2. Double Names: Same Place with Different Names 299
3.3. Hellas and Hellenes 301
3.4. Troy and Troad 302
3.5. Mapping the Theater of War: The Monograph *On the Camp* 303
3.5.1. The Ships in the Achaean Camp 304
3.5.2. The Order of the Greek Contingents in the Camp 305
3.5.3. The Battle at the Achaean Wall 308
3.5.4. The Battlefield in the Trojan Plain 314
3.5.5. The Gates of Troy 315
3.6. The Catalog of the Ships 316
4. Homeric Cosmology 318
4.1. Oceanus 319
4.2. The Stars, the Sun, East, and West 320
4.3. North, South, and the *Oikoumene* 322
4.4. Air, Aether, Heaven, and Olympus 323
5. Homeric Gods 329
5.1. The Gods' Nature, Dwellings, and Powers 329
5.2. The Gods' Epithets 332
6. The World of the Heroes and the World of Homer 333
7. Conclusions 335
3.4. Discovery of Etymology: An Objective, Multipurpose Practice 340
1. Etymological Strategies 342
1.1. Word Segmentation and Phonetic Changes 342
1.2. Sharing of Letters/Consonants (κοινωνία τῶν στοιχείων/συμφώνων) 344
1.3. Reaching beyond Homer 346
2. Etymology: A Method 'from Within' 349
3. Etymology and Homeric *Glossai* 352
3.1. Etymology and Words Used according to the Standard Meaning (κυρίως) 352
3.2. Against the Glossographers 354

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

3.3. Homer and the Neoteroi 357
4. Etymology and Compounds 358
5. Etymology and Interaspiration 361
6. Etymology and Variant Readings 363
7. Aristarchus' Etymology versus Crates' Etymology 365
8. Homer's Etymologies 370
8.1. *Figura Etymologica* (παρετυμολογεῖ [ὁ ποιητής]) 371
8.2. *Nomen Omen* (ὀνοματοθετικὸς ὁ ποιητής) 373
9. Conclusions 374
3.5. Calculation of Analogy: A 'Scientific' Method Applied to the Text 377
1. Types of Analogical Proportions 378
2. Fragments with Aristarchus' Analogies 381
3. The Criteria of Analogy 383
4. The Choice of *Comparanda*: Homer and Beyond 387
5. Semantic Analogy 391
6. The Function of Analogy 394
7. Analogy and Deductive Reasoning 399
8. Implied Analogies and 'Rational Relationships' among Forms 403
9. Herodian's Analogy and Aristarchus' Analogical Proportions 405
10. Conclusions 410
3.6.A. Judgment of Poems: Aristotle's Lesson 413
1. Aristotle and Aristarchus 414
2. A Preliminary Assumption about Tragedy and Epos 416
3. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Plot (μῦθος) 417
4. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Characters (ἤθη) 426
5. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Thought (διάνοια) 434
6. Aristotelian Theory and Aristarchean Practice: Diction (λέξις) 437
7. Conclusions 441
3.6.B. Judgment of Poems: The 'Art' of Athetesis 444
1. The 'Invention' of Athetesis 446
2. A General Rule for Athetesis 447
3. Aristarchus' Atheteseis and Manuscript Evidence 448
4. Main Reasons to Suspect Lines 452
4.1. Internal Inconsistency and Contradictions 453
4.2. Unsuitable Lines 456
4.3. Unbelievability 461
4.4. Superfluous or Unnecessary Lines 463
4.5. Non-Homeric Language or Society 468
5. Additional Reasons to Suspect Lines 469
5.1. 'Prosaic' or 'Cheap' Composition 470
5.2. Tautologies 470
5.3. Repeated Lines 473

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

6. Athetesis of Longer Passages 481
7. Why Should Some Lines Be Athetized? 484
7.1. The Pernicious Work of the 'Interpolators' (διασκευασταί) 485
7.2. Aristarchus and the 'Interpolators' (διασκευασταί) 486
8. Aristarchus' Attempt to Recover the 'Original' Script 490
9. Conclusions 492
3.6.C. Judgment of Poems: The Art of 'Saving' the Homeric Text 497
1. Homer's Formulaic Style 499
1.1. Misuse (κατάχρησις) of Formulaic Lines 499
1.2. Homer's Epithets 502
1.2.1. Generic Epithets (καθολικὰ/κοινὰ ἐπίθετα) and Nongeneric Ones 503
1.2.2. Out-of-Place Epithets (ἄκαιρα ἐπίθετα) 507
1.2.3. Epithets and Poetic License 508
2. Homer's Poetic Persona 510
2.1. The Poet's Persona (ἐκ τοῦ ἰδίου/ποιητικοῦ προσώπου) and His Characters' Persona (ἐκ τοῦ ἡρωϊκοῦ προσώπου) 510
2.2 The Poet 'Speaks Up' (ἀναφωνεῖ [ὁ ποιητής]) 512
2.3. The Poet Speaks in Anticipation (προαναφωνεῖ [ὁ ποιητής]) 514
2.4. Homer's Rhetorical Questions (and Answers) 515
2.5. Homer's Direct Addresses (ἀποστροφαί) 516
2.6. Homer's 'Generic You' (ὡς πρός τινα / ὡς πρὸς ὑποκείμενον πρόσωπον) 517
3. Homer's Narrative Technique 519
3.1. Events Which Happened 'Tacitly' (κατὰ τὸ σιωπώμενον) 519
3.2. Events by Conclusion (κατὰ συμπέρασμα) or in Summary (κεφαλαιωδῶς) 521
3.3. Summaries with Details and Detailed Descriptions 523
3.4. Completing the Audience's Knowledge 525
3.5. Handling of Plot and Time: Zielinski's Law 527
3.6. Switching between Narrative and Speech 532
4. Pathos and Feelings in Homer 532
5. *Zetemata* and *Lyseis* 535
6. Aristarchus' 'Judgment' (κρίσις) of Homeric Mistakes 540
7. Conclusions 542

PART 4. ARISTARCHUS AND HIS COLLEAGUES

4. Aristarchus and His Colleagues: Zenodotus, Aristophanes, and Others 547
1. Aristarchus and Zenodotus 548
1.1. Sources 548
1.2. Zenodotus, ὁ οὐχ Ὁμηρικός 551

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

1.2.1. Zenodotus and Homeric Vocabulary 551
1.2.2. Zenodotus, Homeric Morphology, and Syntax 553
1.2.3. Zenodotus, Homeric Style, and the Heroic World 555
1.3. Zenodotus, the Anti-Aristotelian 557
1.3.1. 'Unbelievable' and 'Contradictory' Textual Choices 557
1.3.2. Unfitting Characters and Thoughts 558
1.3.3. Athetesis (or Deletion) of 'Necessary' Lines 560
1.4. Zenodotus, a Careless Reader 561
1.5. Aristarchus on Zenodotus: An Uneasy Relationship 566
1.5.1. An Obsession Called Zenodotus? 566
1.5.2. Aristarchus' Attempt at Objectivity 569
1.6. Zenodotus' Text: Deletions, Atheteseis, and Additions 572
1.7. Is Zenodotus Really the One to Blame? 575
2. Aristarchus and Aristophanes of Byzantium 578
3. Aristarchus and Other Alexandrian Scholars 582
4. Aristarchus and Crates of Mallos 583
4.1. Aristarchus' Knowledge of Crates' Work (and Vice Versa) 584
4.2. The Aristonicus Scholia Discussing Crates' Views 587
5. Conclusions 591

PART 5. ARISTARCHUS' HOMER

5.1. Aristarchus and Homeric Language 597
1. A Synchronic or Diachronic Perspective? 598
1.1. Homer versus Us: The Otherness of Homeric Diction 599
1.2. Some Diachronic Clues 599
2. Aristarchus and Homeric Dialectal Nuances 601
2.1. Ionic 602
2.1.1. η instead of α and Ionic Shortenings 602
2.1.2. Other Ionic Features: Omission of Articles, Morphology, and Aspiration 604
2.2. Attic 605
2.2.1. The Dual 607
2.2.2. The Dual in the Embassy to Achilles in Book 9 608
2.3. Aeolic 612
2.4. Doric 615
3. *Scriptio Continua* and Dialectal Solutions 616
4. Conclusions 620
5.2. The 'Homeric Question' 623
1. The Poet Is the Same (ὁ αὐτὸς ἄρα ποιητής) 624
2. The Polemics with the Chorizontes 627

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

2.1. Who Were the Chorizontes? 627
2.2. Fighting the Chorizontes 628
2.3. Some Weaker Arguments against the Chorizontes 633
3. Clarifying the *Odyssey* from the *Iliad* (and Vice Versa) 639
3.1. Linguistic and Stylistic Parallels 639
3.2. Solving *Zetemata* with the Help of the Other Poem 642
3.3. Atheteseis between the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey* 644
4. Conclusions 649
5.3. Homer and the Neoteroi 652
1. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Language 653
2. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Geography 657
3. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Myths 661
3.1. Myths and Characters of the Trojan War 661
3.1.1. The Origin of the Trojan War and Its Beginnings 662
3.1.2. Achilles and His Family 667
3.1.3. Ajax the Great 670
3.2. Other Myths Where Homer Is Different from the Neoteroi 671
3.2.1. Atreus and His Family 671
3.2.2. Helen and Theseus 672
3.2.3. Sarpedon and His Family 672
3.2.4. Niobe 674
3.2.5. Heracles and Oedipus 677
3.3. Neoteric Narratives Inspired by Homer 679
3.4. They Got It Wrong: When the Neoteric Inspiration Is Flawed 681
3.4.1. Misunderstanding of Homeric Scenes and Images 681
3.4.2. Misunderstanding of Homeric Language 684
4. Homer versus the Neoteroi: Gods 687
4.1. The Divine World 687
4.2. Enyalius and Paean 688
4.3. The Aegis 693
5. Homer versus Hesiod 695
5.1. Clarifying Homer from Hesiod 695
5.2. Hesiod Is Not Homer: The Hesiodic Otherness 697
5.3. He Got It Wrong: Hesiod Misreads Homer 699
5.4. Aristarchus on the Age of Hesiod (πρὸς τὰ περὶ ἡλικίας Ἡσιόδου) 702
6. Aristarchus and the Cycle 703
7. Conclusions 705
5.4. Aristarchus and Homeric Characters 709
1. Achilles 710
2. Agamemnon 717

The Best of the Grammarians: Aristarchus of Samothrace on the Iliad
Francesca Schironi
https://www.press.umich.edu/8769399/best_of_the_grammarians
University of Michigan Press, 2018

3. Ajax 718
4. Odysseus 720
5. Hector 721
6. Priam 725
7. Andromache 726
8. Conclusions 728
6. Conclusions 733
1. Aristarchus in Context 734
2. Aristarchus' Assumptions 735
2.1. Assumption 1: Homer Was a Flawless Poet 736
2.2. Assumption 2: Homer Was Internally Self-Consistent 736
2.3. Assumption 3: Homer Was the Sole Author of Both the *Iliad* and the *Odyssey* 737
3. Aristarchus' Methodological Rules 738
3.1. Rule 1: To Read the Text Attentively 738
3.2. Rule 2: To Make Use of Contextual Information 739
3.3. Rule 3: To Have a Full Knowledge of the Homeric Poems 740
3.4. Rule 4: To Consider the Homeric Poems as a Self-Sufficient Microcosm 740
4. Aristarchus' Assumptions and Rules at Work 741
5. Aristarchus and Aristotle 742
6. Aristarchus and Crates, *Grammatikoi* and *Kritikoi* 744
7. Aristarchus and Hellenistic Science 749
8. Aristarchus the Empiricist 753
9. Some Problems in Aristarchus' Method 756
10. Aristarchus' Legacy 759

Technical Terms Often Used in This Book 763

Bibliography 765

Index I: General Index 803

Index II: Index of Greek Technical Terms Connected with Aristarchus' Exegesis 839

Index III: Index of the Homeric Words Commented Upon by Aristarchus 849

Index IV: Index of the Homeric Scholia 857

Index V: Index of Other Ancient Sources 897