Judges and Unjust Laws: Common Law Constitutionalism and the Foundations of Judicial Review Douglas E. Edlin http://www.press.umich.edu/titleDetailDesc.do?id=319239 The University of Michigan Press

Contents

Acknowledgments xiii **I. INTRODUCTION: "THE JUSTICE OF THE** COMMON LAW" I A. Unjust Laws I B. The "Moral-Formal Dilemma" 2 C. Unsatisfying Answers 4 D. An Alternative 5 E. Types of Injustice 12 2. THE COMMON LAW 22 A. Sources 23 B. Process 26 C. Content 28 D. Structure 32 3. THE SOURCE-BASED ARGUMENT FOR THE JUDICIAL **OBLIGATION TO APPLY THE LAW** 33 A. Stare Decisis 33 B. Legislative Supremacy 41

4. THE CONCEPTUAL ARGUMENT FOR THE JUDICIAL OBLIGATION TO APPLY THE LAW 47

Judges and Unjust Laws: Common Law Constitutionalism and the Foundations of Judicial Review Douglas E. Edlin http://www.press.umich.edu/titleDetailDesc.do?id=319239 The University of Michigan Press

5. THE SOURCE-BASED ARGUMENT FOR THE JUDICIAL OBLIGATION TO DEVELOP THE LAW: PART I (ENGLAND) 53

- A. *Dr. Bonham's Case* and the Common Law That Controls Acts of Parliament 53
- B. *Omychund v. Barker* and the Common Law That Works Itself Pure 74

6. THE SOURCE-BASED ARGUMENT FOR THE JUDICIAL OBLIGATION TO DEVELOP THE LAW: PART II (UNITED STATES) 79

A. The Origins of Common Law Review in the State Courts 79

- B. The Origins of Common Law Review in the Supreme Court 91
- C. Common Law and Natural Law, Again 102
- D. The Source-Based Judicial Obligation to Develop the Law 107

7. THE CONCEPTUAL ARGUMENT FOR THE JUDICIAL OBLIGATION TO DEVELOP THE LAW 112

- A. Role Obligations 113
- B. Disagreements about the Law: DissentingOpinions and the Design of the Common Law 114
- C. Judges and Justice 119
- D. Disagreements about the Judge's Role: Interpreting the Judicial Function 124
- E. Consequences of Judicial Failure to Develop the Law 130

8. COMMON LAW REVIEW 138

- A. Analytic Features 139
- B. Adjudging a Statute Void: The Form and Exercise of Common Law Review 149
- C. Applying and Developing the Law: Common Law Review, Stare Decisis, and Legislative Supremacy 150
- D. Common Law Principles and Rule-of-Law Values: The Example of Ouster Clauses 159
- E. Responding to Radbruch 163
- F. Summing Up 167

Judges and Unjust Laws: Common Law Constitutionalism and the Foundations of Judicial Review Douglas E. Edlin http://www.press.umich.edu/titleDetailDesc.do?id=319239 The University of Michigan Press

9. COMMON LAW REVIEW IN TWO COMMON

LAW SYSTEMS 169

- A. England 169
- B. United States 187

IO. CONCLUSION 192

A. Types of Injustice 192 B. An Alternative 193 C. Unsatisfying Answers 196 D. The "Moral-Formal Dilemma" 196 E. Unjust Laws 197 Table of Authorities 199 Notes 207 References 283 Index 301