

The Street Porter and the Philosopher: Conversations on Analytical Egalitarianism  
Sandra J. Peart and David M. Levy, editors  
<http://www.press.umich.edu/titleDetailDesc.do?id=212207>  
The University of Michigan Press

## **The Street Porter and the Philosopher**

The Street Porter and the Philosopher: Conversations on Analytical Egalitarianism  
Sandra J. Peart and David M. Levy, editors  
<http://www.press.umich.edu/titleDetailDesc.do?id=212207>  
The University of Michigan Press

# **The Street Porter and the Philosopher**

*Conversations on Analytical Egalitarianism*

**Edited by Sandra J. Peart and David M. Levy**

**THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS • Ann Arbor**

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2008  
All rights reserved  
Published in the United States of America by  
The University of Michigan Press  
Manufactured in the United States of America  
© Printed on acid-free paper

2011 2010 2009 2008 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced,  
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form  
or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,  
without the written permission of the publisher.

*A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.*

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The street porter and the philosopher : conversations on analytical  
egalitarianism / edited by Sandra J. Peart and David M. Levy.  
p. cm.  
Includes index.  
ISBN-13: 978-0-472-11644-7 (cloth : alk. paper)  
ISBN-10: 0-472-11644-4 (cloth : alk. paper)  
1. Equality. I. Peart, Sandra. II. Levy, David M., 1944–  
JC575.S77 2008  
320.01'1—dc22 2008008260

## Contents

Acknowledgments	vii
<b>1 • Introduction: The Street Porter and the Philosopher Contextualized</b> <i>Sandra J. Peart and David M. Levy</i>	1
<b>PART 1 • Politics, Markets, and Equality</b>	
<b>2 • Politics as Exchange or Politics as Power: Two Views of Government</b> <i>James M. Buchanan and Warren J. Samuels</i>	15
<b>3 • The Theory of Economic Policy in British Classical Political Economy: A Sympathetic Reading</b> <i>David M. Levy and Sandra J. Peart</i>	41
<b>4 • Economic Organization, Distribution, and the Equality Issue: The Marx-Engels Perspective</b> <i>Samuel Hollander</i>	64
<b>5 • Robust Analytical Egalitarianism: Worst-Case Political Economy and the Socialist Calculation Debate</b> <i>Eric Crampton and Andrew Farrant</i>	108
<b>PART 2 • Smithian Themes</b>	
<b>6 • Sacred Economics</b> <i>Deirdre McCloskey</i>	135
<b>7 • The Origins of Das Adam Smith Problem and Our Understanding of Sympathy</b> <i>Leonidas Montes</i>	158
<b>8 • Adam Smith's Invisible Hand</b> <i>Warren J. Samuels</i>	179
<b>9 • <i>In Medio Stat Virtus</i>: An Alternative View of Usury in Adam Smith's Thinking</b> <i>Maria Pia Paganelli</i>	202
<b>10 • The Measure of Real Price: Adam Smith's Science of Equity</b> <i>Eric Schliesser</i>	228

**PART 3 • The Role of the Expert**

- 11 •** Attitudes toward Race, Hierarchy, and Transformation in the Nineteenth Century: The Role of the Expert  
*Sandra J. Peart and David M. Levy* 239
- 12 •** Frank Knight, Worst-Case Theorizing, and Economic Planning: Socialism as Monopoly Politics  
*Andrew Farrant* 261
- 13 •** On Hayek's Road to Serfdom: Sixty Years Later  
*M. Ali Khan* 269
- 14 •** Hiring a Foreign Expert: Chile in the Nineteenth Century  
*Juan Pablo Couyoumdjian* 289

**PART 4 • Literature, Biology, and Economics**

- 15 •** Is a Novel a Model? *Tyler Cowen* 319
- 16 •** Denying Human Homogeneity: Eugenics and the Making of Postclassical Economics  
*Sandra J. Peart and David M. Levy* 338
- 17 •** More Merciful and Not Less Effective: Eugenics and American Economics in the Progressive Era  
*Thomas C. Leonard* 358
- 18 •** Evolution and Human Behavior *Gordon Tullock* 383

**PART 5 • The Buchanan-Rawls Correspondence**

- 19 •** Introduction and Correspondence  
*David M. Levy and Sandra J. Peart* 397
- The Texts 405
- Contributors 417
- Index 421

## Acknowledgments

The Summer Institute for the Preservation of the History of Economics owes its existence to our belief that economists benefit from the ability to read the texts of past economists. The classical liberal tradition itself cannot be understood without knowledge of the writings of the great British classical liberal economists. David Kennedy, then President of the Earhart Foundation, suggested that we apply to the Foundation for a grant to support a meeting in the summer of 2000. The generosity of the Earhart Foundation continues to help support the Summer Institute. We are particularly grateful for a grant that helped make this book possible.

During the first five years, from which the contributions in the book are drawn, David Levy received additional financial support and encouragement from the Center for Study of Public Choice and the Department of Economics at George Mason. The last years have seen many changes at the Center. Carol Roberts and Janet Byrd, who were both here when the Summer Institute began, have passed away. We miss them.

Sandra Peart received summer support from Baldwin-Wallace College; her sabbatical in 2004–5, when much of the initial work for the collection was done, was supported by the Earhart Foundation and the Mercatus Center.

The conversation between James Buchanan and Warren Samuels (Chapter 2), and Warren Samuels's "Adam Smith's Invisible Hand" (Chapter 8), were taped during the Summer Institute of 2004 and transcribed by Jo Ann Burgess. Chapter 3, David Levy and Sandra Peart's "The Theory of Economic Policy is British Classical Political Economy," is reprinted with the permission of Duke University Press from *The History of Political Economy*, where it appeared in 2005, volume 37 (Suppl. 1). Chapter 4, Samuel Hollander's "Economic Organization, Distribution and the Equality Issue," is reprinted with the permission of Springer from *The Review of Austrian Economics*, where it appeared in 2004, volume 17 (1).

Chapter 6, "Sacred Economics," is an early version of Deirdre McCloskey's *Bourgeois Virtues*, reprinted with permission of the University

of Chicago Press, where it appeared in 2006. Chapter 9, Maria Pia Paganelli's "*In Medio Stat Virtus*," is reprinted with the permission of Duke University Press from *The History of Political Economy*, where it appeared in 2003, volume 35 (1). Sandra Peart and David Levy's "Attitudes Toward Race, Hierarchy and Transformation in the Nineteenth Century" is reprinted with the permission of the editors of *The History of Economic Thought*, where it appeared in 2005, volume 47. Chapter 12, Andrew Farrant's "Frank Knight, Worst-Case Theorizing, and Economic Planning," is reprinted with the permission of Duke University Press from *The History of Political Economy*, where it appeared in 2004, volume 36 (3). Chapter 16, Sandra Peart and David Levy's "Denying Human Homogeneity," is reprinted with the permission of the *Journal of the History of Economic Thought*, where it appeared in 2003, volume 23. Chapter 17, Thomas Leonard's "More Merciful and Not Less Effective," is reprinted with the permission of Duke University Press from *The History of Political Economy*, where it appeared in 2003, volume 35 (4). Gordon Tullock's "Evolution and Human Behavior" is reprinted with the permission of Springer from the *Journal of Bioeconomics*, where it appeared in 2002, volume 4 (2). Finally, the letters between James Buchanan and John Rawls are published with the gracious permission of James Buchanan and the estate of John Rawls.

For this volume, we have been fortunate to deal with a fine economics editor at the University of Michigan Press, Jim Reische, who found helpful reviewers for the manuscript. Sarah Remington assisted with the production. Marcia La Brenz once again served as senior copyeditor coordinator. The bulk of the proof reading was borne by Michael D. Thomas. Emily Jane Perry checked the transcription of the Buchanan-Rawls correspondence with very sharp eyes. Lisa Hill-Corley kept track of the finances and helped with the permissions.

The Summer Institute takes time. David thanks Nicholas and Milton for their support and remembers his mother's. Sandra Peart thanks her two sons, Nathan and Matthew, and husband Craig, for many weeks away from home while at the Summer Institute. Nathan and Matthew enjoyed meeting Daniel Hammond, Steven Medema, and Warren Samuels over lox and bagels at the Institute breakfast and Summer Institute barbeques on the lawn of the Buchanan House.