

C A G E   O F   F R E E D O M

---

Tamil Identity and the Ethnic  
Fetish in Malaysia

Andrew C. Willford

The University of Michigan Press    *Ann Arbor*

# To Vasantha

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2006  
All rights reserved  
Published in the United States of America by  
The University of Michigan Press  
Manufactured in the United States of America  
⊗ Printed on acid-free paper

2009 2008 2007 2006 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced,  
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form  
or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,  
without the written permission of the publisher.

*A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.*

## Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Willford, Andrew C. (Andrew Clinton)

Cage of freedom : Tamil identity and the ethnic fetish in Malaysia /  
Andrew C. Willford.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references.

ISBN-13: 978-0-472-09956-6 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-472-09956-6 (cloth : alk. paper)

ISBN-13: 978-0-472-06956-9 (pbk. : alk. paper)

ISBN-10: 0-472-06956-X (pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Tamil (Indic people)—Malaysia—Religion. 2. Tamil (Indic  
people)—Malaysia—Ethnic identity. 3. Hinduism—Malaysia. I. Title.

BL1164.3.W55 2006

305.89'48110595—dc22

2006011680

# Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	v
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
CHAPTER 1.	
Introduction	I
CHAPTER 2.	
Marginal Existence and Social Distance “Worthless Dregs in a Prosperous Society”	15
CHAPTER 3.	
The Ritual Expression of Tamil Identity in Malaysia A Festival of Power and Penance	53
CHAPTER 4.	
Fetish, Space, and Displacement in Kuala Lumpur Tamils and the Ethnic Uncanny	84
CHAPTER 5.	
Hindu Ecumenical Movements and “Middleness” Familiarity and Ambivalence in Tamil Identity	125
CHAPTER 6.	
Making Distinctions “We Had Become the Laughingstock of Other Races”	200
CHAPTER 7.	
Sacred Malaysia, Greater India	261

Notes	295
Bibliography	321
Index	335

# Figures

Fig. 1.	Rubber plantation workers, circa 1900	19
Fig. 2.	Tamil schoolchildren in front of their school on a plantation	20
Fig. 3.	Retired plantation workers, husband and wife	30
Fig. 4.	Estate (plantation) temple	48
Fig. 5.	The Kuala Lumpur Tower. The Islamic motifs on its underside were designed by Persian artisans.	55
Fig. 6.	The steps to the Batu Caves shrine crowded with pilgrims during Thaipusam	62
Fig. 7.	Idumban pierced by Murugan's Vel at the entrance to the Batu Caves shrine	64
Fig. 8.	A devotee having a Vel inserted into her tongue after falling into trance during Thaipusam	67
Fig. 9.	A devotee carrying a <i>mayil</i> (peacock) <i>kavadi</i> with the image of Murugan prior to bathing and entering trance	68
Fig. 10.	An entranced devotee dancing with the <i>kavadi</i>	69
Fig. 11.	A devotee with a Vel	70
Fig. 12.	A devotee carrying tiny milk pots while ropes are pulled from hooks embedded in his back	71
Fig. 13.	A devotee dressed as Kaliamman	72
Fig. 14.	Devotees possessed by Muniandy and Kaliamman	73
Fig. 15.	Downtown Kuala Lumpur. The colonial era Abdul Sultan Samad building is flanked by the Kuala Lumpur Tower and the Maybank building, which can be seen in the distance.	89
Fig. 16.	The Petronas Towers, which are said to resemble the minarets of a mosque	95

Fig. 17. Women falling into trace during Adi Puram	101
Fig. 18. A possessed devotee blessing a child	105
Fig. 19. A woman falling into trance spontaneously while observing other devotees	107
Fig. 20. A devotee speaking in tongues to the entranced woman seconds later	108
Fig. 21. The “universal prayer” outside the Divine Life Society ashram near the Batu Caves	134
Fig. 22. The Temple of Fine Arts production of the <i>Ramayana</i> , Thai court scene. In an Asian confluence, Thai costumes with Indian motifs blend into the background. Notice the Indian sage in the right-hand corner.	181
Fig. 23. Lord Shiva as Nataraja	194
Fig. 24. <i>Arati</i> and <i>puja</i> in a plantation temple	216
Fig. 25. The Kandasamy temple in Brickfields. This Ceylonese- managed temple is popular among middle-class Hindus.	218
Fig. 26. Indian restaurants and provision shops in Brickfields	227
Fig. 27. Valli performing a <i>puja</i>	241
Fig. 28. Putrajaya. The new Parliament building for the Malaysian government.	272

# Abbreviations

ABIM	Angkatan Belia Islam Malaysia (Muslim Youth Movement of Malaysia)
AMCJA	All Malayan Council of Joint Action
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
BN	Barisan Nasional (National Front)
CIAM	Central Indian Association of Malaya
DAP	Democratic Action Party
DMK	Dravida Munnetra Kazhagam
FELDA	Federal Land Development Authority
GNP	gross national product
IIL	Indian Independence League
IMP	Independence of Malaya Party
INA	Indian National Army
IPF	Indian Progressive Front
ISA	Internal Security Act
MCA	Malaysian Chinese Association
MCP	Malayan Communist Party
MIC	Malaysian Indian Congress
MPAJA	Malayan Peoples Anti-Japanese Army
NEP	New Economic Policy
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NLFCS	National Land Finance Cooperative Society
NUPW	National Union of Plantation Workers
PAS	Parti Islam Se-Malaysia (Malaysian Islamic Party)
PMFTU	Pan-Malayan Federation of Trade Unions
PRM	Parti Rakyat Malaysia (Malaysian People's Party)
PSM	Parti Socialist Malaysia (Malaysian Socialist Party)

RKM	Ramakrishna Mission
RTM	Radio Television Malaysia
TFA	Temple of Fine Arts
UMNO	United Malays National Organization

## Acknowledgments

This journey began with a miscue. I traveled to Malaysia to begin a Fulbright He Fellowship in the summer of 1992. After finding an academic adviser at the University of Malaya and completing the Fulbright orientation program, I thought I was about to embark on a productive year of dissertation research. But it was not to be. I was informed that my project, being on a “religious revival,” was “sensitive.” Much to my disappointment, my research visa was not approved. Though I appealed, my dissertation research was redirected to India, at least temporarily.

After six months of fieldwork and language training with a private tutor in Bangalore, I returned to the United States and decided to pursue more training in Tamil at the University of California at Berkeley. After spending over a year there, and seriously contemplating writing a dissertation combining my work in Bangalore with some modest fieldwork I had begun in the Bay Area on Hindu temples and ashrams and more generally among South Asian immigrants, I finally heard in the spring of 1994 that my appeal for a research visa in Malaysia was being reconsidered. With renewed hope, I applied for funding, and on being awarded a small grant embarked on what I thought would be six months of fieldwork in Malaysia. While there, I found out that another grant had been awarded, thus allowing me to conduct fieldwork for about eighteen months. When the funding was exhausted, I took a job at a private college in Kuala Lumpur, supporting myself for another year-plus of fieldwork, allowing me thirty months of uninterrupted work. Short follow-up trips in 1997 and 2001 supplemented this. What had started off as frustrated bad fortune had in the end been a serendipitous journey that not only made me more determined to work in Malaysia but also enriched that experience through the comparative lens of Bangalore, travels in Tamil Nadu, and work in the

Bay Area. As it turned out, I was now better prepared to embark on a study of Tamil and Hindu revivalism in Malaysia.

The dissertation, naturally, ended up focusing on Malaysia. But there was a lengthy comparative section on the politics of Hindu and Tamil identity in Bangalore. For this book, I present a somewhat streamlined ethnography drawn from the Malaysian material.

Throughout this long and winding road, I had the unflagging support of my doctoral committee at the University of California at San Diego. Suzanne Brenner and Freddy Bailey were outstanding and dedicated teachers, not to mention good friends. Without their tireless and meticulous guidance, I would have endlessly stumbled. The rest of my committee, Christena Turner, Richard Madsen, and Tanya Luhrmann, were also extremely helpful and encouraging. Michael Meeker, too, always knew just what to say to get me thinking productively and in new directions. I also learned much from Ted Schwartz, Mel Spiro, John Borneman, Joel Robbins, Jim Holston, and Bob Levy. My colleagues Joe Masco and Joao Vargas were a source of friendship and inspiration at crucial but different stages in graduate school.

At Berkeley, I had the good fortune of studying with George and Kausalya Hart. Their love of Tamil language and literature has been a source of great nourishment. Christian Ghasarian, a fellow traveler and friend, helped keep me sane in tough times. Eugene Irschick and Lawrence Cohen were there with encouraging words and sound advice when I needed it most.

In Bangalore, Dr. S. Carlos has been a wonderful teacher, friend, and colleague. Our collaborative work in Bangalore is ongoing.

At Cornell University, all of my colleagues in the Southeast Asia Program (SEAP) have been a constant and unending source of knowledge, amazing me with their expertise about the region in which I still consider myself an intellectual interloper. I have learned a lot from Stan O'Connor, John Wolff, Keith Taylor, Kaja McGowan, Thak Chaloemtiarana, Tamara Loos, and all my other colleagues in SEAP. Ben Anderson has been both a warm colleague and a big influence on my thinking. As much as I have learned from his writings on Southeast Asia and nationalism, I learned much more by serving with him in the program and especially within the SEAP Publications editorial committee. Deborah Homsher kept me faithful to the project. I am also indebted to Shelley Feldman for her support,

collegiality, and sharp intellect. Eric Tagliacozzo has been my brother in arms, good buddy, and inspiring colleague.

Within the Department of Anthropology at Cornell, I have enjoyed the company of all of my colleagues. Bonnie Blanding-May, Margaret Rolfe, Barbara Donnell, and Donna Duncan have been generous to a fault. I have undoubtedly made them work too hard. David Holmberg, Kathryn March, Terry Turner, Jane Fajans, Hiro Miyazaki, Dominic Boyer, Annelise Riles, Johanna Schoss, Davydd Greenwood, Jakob Rigi, Vilma Santiago-Irizarry, Viranjini Munasinghe, Nerissa Russell, Yohko Tsuji, and Fred Gleach have been important to me, and absolutely fabulous colleagues. Fred Gleach also helped me to scan some of my old photos for the book. I single out two of my colleagues for being particularly important touchstones these last six years. Steve Sangren has been a supportive and intellectually challenging colleague and a generous friend. Jim Siegel has, from my first day at Cornell, shown a keen interest in my work. This has been my good fortune, as his timely and always brilliant interventions have been a constant source of astonishment and wonder. His friendship, and that of Anne Berger, also means a lot to me and my family.

In Malaysia, I wish to thank all of my interlocutors and colleagues, too numerous to mention. Professors Raymond Lee, K. S. Jomo, Susan Oorjitham, and K. Thilagawathi deserve special mention for their kind assistance and expertise. Shankar Kandasamy was particularly helpful. Toh Puan Uma Sambathan shared a wealth of verbal history. She also showed (and continues to show) great concern for my family and myself. She certainly walks in spirit. The late Brahmachari, Maniam, from the Ramakrishna Mission in Petaling Jaya, was a great soul. It was an honor to know him. Baldev Sidhu has provided a steady stream of sartorial wit and wisdom. Amirthalingam (“Lingam”) Kanagasabai and Rubini Kulasingham have been dear friends, as well as providing tremendous assistance. Dr. S. Nagarajan has in recent years helped me to see much that I did not understand about Malaysian Indian communities. My work with him is ongoing. Kala Kovan, formerly with the Malaysian American Commission on Educational Exchange, helped much in the initial logistics of settling down in Malaysia. She also aided me greatly when I returned as a Fulbright CIES Fellow for one year in 2003–4. I also thank the Economic Planning Unit of the Prime Minister’s Department for granting and renewing my research visa.

My initial thirty months of fieldwork in Malaysia were supported by grants from the Southeast Asia Council of the Association for Asian Studies and by the Wenner-Gren Foundation for Anthropological Research. Subsequent shorter trips in 1997 and 2001 were supported by the University of California at San Diego and Cornell's Southeast Asia Program, respectively. A Fulbright CIES fellowship for 2003–4 allowed me to follow up and update my dissertation research for this book, while also affording me an opportunity to conduct extensive new research that is not yet represented in print. Production of this book was supported through the Hull Fund at Cornell University. The Department of Anthropology at Cornell also provided generous financial assistance, which aided in the latter stage of production.

Danilyn Rutherford and Rosalind Morris read the entire manuscript, offering generously constructive and oftentimes masterful criticism. I am greatly indebted to them for their careful thought and meticulous reading. Although I could not accomplish all that they suggested, this book owes much to them, though its shortcomings are of my own doing. Ken George also read parts of the manuscript and offered important suggestions that ultimately made the argument stronger. Webb Keane, Vince Rafael, Fenella Cannell, Smita Lahiri, Patsy Spyer, Alexandra Kent, Richard Baxstrom, Erick White, and Thamora Fishel also had much appreciated words of encouragement. Finally, my graduate students at Cornell have always propelled me forward in many ways, while never ceasing to amaze.

Raphael Allen has been a reassuring and supportive editor. His expert hand helped me to prioritize, while his intellectual inclinations were refreshing in an age in which the bottom line seems to rule the day. Christy Byks, Mary Hashman, and the rest of the staff at the University of Michigan Press have been terrific throughout the revision and production process. I am very grateful to all.

My wife's family (and now mine) in Malaysia and Singapore has become an important window of understanding for me. Singaram "Anna" (older brother) has been particularly supportive, though all have been generous with me.

Finally, my father majored in anthropology back in the 1950s at the University of California. His love of culture and history and his general intellectual curiosity have had a lot to do with my career trajectory. Both my mother and my father have made enormous sacrifices for my education

and career. Their undying support, love, and patience can never be appreciated enough. My sister's encouragement (and "care packages") over the years has been more sustaining than she probably realizes. My brother-in-law, Steve, and my two nephews, Cole and Erik, provided many happy and necessary distractions. Last, Vasantha, my love, best friend, and partner in life, has made this her (several) journey(ies), as well. Though I certainly do not give her enough credit, whatever value there is to this work derives its sustenance from her. She also read and commented at every stage of the dissertation, and now the book-writing process, and has endured the many sacrifices of time and energy with patience, a sense of humor, and a much needed sense of perspective. Our children, Anisha and Rabindra, have been our joy and tears and a real life.

Some passages and ethnographic vignettes appeared in earlier forms in the following publications. I thank the editors and publishers of the following journals and press for permission to reprint materials from:

"The 'Already Surmounted', yet 'Secretly Familiar': Malaysian Identity as Symptom," *Cultural Anthropology* 21 (February 2006).

"The Modernist Vision from Below: Malaysian Hinduism and the 'Way of Prayers'," in *Spirited Politics: Public Life and Religion in Contemporary Southeast Asia*, Andrew C. Willford and Kenneth George eds. (Southeast Asia Program, Cornell University, 2005).

"Possession and Displacement in Kuala Lumpur's Ethnic Landscape," *International Social Science Journal* 55 (2003, 175).

"'Weapons of the Meek': Ecstatic Ritualism and Strategic Ecumenism among Tamil-Hindus in Malaysia," *Identities* 9(2) (2002).

All of the photographs are mine except where indicated.