

Protest
AND THE
Politics of Blame

Interests, Identities, and Institutions in Comparative Politics

Series Editor:

Mark I. Lichbach, University of Maryland

Editorial Advisory Board:

Barbara Geddes, University of California, Los Angeles

James C. Scott, Yale University

Sven Steinmo, University of Colorado

Kathleen Thelen, Northwestern University

Alan Zuckerman, Brown University

The post–Cold War world faces a series of defining global challenges: virulent forms of conflict, the resurgence of the market as the basis for economic organization, and the construction of democratic institutions.

The books in this series take advantage of the rich development of different approaches to comparative politics in order to offer new perspectives on these problems. The books explore the emerging theoretical and methodological synergisms and controversies about social conflict, political economy, and institutional development.

Democracy without Associations: Transformation of the Party System and Social Cleavages in India, by Pradeep K. Chhibber

Gendering Politics: Women in Israel, by Hanna Herzog

Origins of Liberal Dominance: State, Church, and Party in Nineteenth-Century Europe, by Andrew C. Gould

The Deadlock of Democracy in Brazil, by Barry Ames

Political Science as Puzzle Solving, edited by Bernard Grofman

Institutions and Innovation: Voters, Parties, and Interest Groups in the Consolidation of Democracy—France and Germany, 1870–1939, by Marcus Kreuzer

Altering Party Systems: Strategic Behavior and the Emergence of New Political Parties in Western Democracies, by Simon Hug

Managing “Modernity”: Work, Community, and Authority in Late-Industrializing Japan and Russia, by Rudra Sil

Re-Forming the State: The Politics of Privatization in Latin America and Europe, by Hector E. Schamis

Protest and the Politics of Blame: The Russian Response to Unpaid Wages, by Debra Javeline

Protest
AND THE
Politics of Blame

The Russian Response to Unpaid Wages

DEBRA JAVELINE

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN PRESS
Ann Arbor

Copyright © by the University of Michigan 2003
All rights reserved
Published in the United States of America by
The University of Michigan Press
Manufactured in the United States of America
⊗ Printed on acid-free paper

2006 2005 2004 2003 4 3 2 1

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored
in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form
or by any means, electronic, mechanical, or otherwise,
without the written permission of the publisher.

A CIP catalog record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Javeline, Debra, 1967–

Protest and the politics of blame : the Russian response to unpaid
wages / Debra Javeline.

p. cm. — (Interests, identities, and institutions in
comparative politics)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-472-11306-2 (cloth : alk. paper)

1. Wages—Russia (Federation). 2. Blame—Political aspects—
Russia (Federation). 3. Social psychology—Russia (Federation)
4. Social surveys—Russia (Federation) I. Title. II. Series.

HD5047 .2 .J38 2003

331.2'1'0947—dc21

2002152250

IN LOVING MEMORY OF

Anna Goldberg

Contents

List of Figures ix

List of Tables xi

Acknowledgments xiii

Introduction 1

The Crisis

The Reaction

The Puzzle

The Structure of This Book

Chapter 1. Why Blame Attribution Matters for Protest 13

Explanations for Protest and Passivity in Russia

Issue Difficulty and Blame Attribution

Blame Attribution and Collective Action Theory

The Importance of Blame Attribution for Human Behavior

What is a “Normal” Amount of Protest?

How Much Protest Is There in Russia?

What We Can Learn from Individual-Level Data

Conclusion

Chapter 2. Wage Arrears in Russia: A Difficult Issue 53

The Role of the Central Authorities

The Role of Regional and Local Authorities

The Role of Enterprises and Enterprise Managers

The Role of the General Economic Situation and the Transition Period

The Role of International Organizations and Foreign Governments

The Role of the Russian People

Other Sources of Wage Arrears

Specifying Blameworthy Individuals and Institutions

Blame-Avoiding Strategies

Blame-Avoiding Institutions and Circumstances

Conclusion

Chapter 3. Whom Russians Blame for Wage Arrears 97

Multicausality and Information Overload

Measuring the Attribution of Blame

Blame Cast Widely and Inconsistently
No Clear Saviors or Solutions
What Explains the Attribution of Blame?
Conclusion

Chapter 4. The Politics of Blame 129

Protesting Wage Arrears
Blame Attribution and Individual Responses to Wage Arrears
Blame Attribution and Group Responses to Wage Arrears
Feedback: Protest's Influence on Blame Attribution
Conclusion

*Chapter 5. Alternative Explanations for the
Russian Response to Wage Arrears* 161

Economic Arguments
Psychological Arguments
Cultural Arguments
Organizational Arguments
Opportunities and Constraints
Other Explanations for Protest and Passivity
The Robust Relationship Between Blame and Protest
Conclusion

Chapter 6. Implications 223

The Study of Blame Attribution and Collective Action Theory
Blame and Protest in Comparative Perspective
The Unlikelihood of Social Unrest in Russia
Alcoholism, Depression, and Learned Helplessness
Scapegoating and Demagoguery

Appendix A. How the Survey Was Conducted 243

Appendix B. Survey Questions 247

References 267

Index 285

Figures

- I.1. Wage Arrears and Average Household Income 5
- 1.1. Wage Arrears and Strikes 37
- 2.1. Federal Wage Arrears as Percentage of Overall Wage Arrears 56
- 3.1. Blaming the People Themselves 106
- 3.2. Confidence in Russian Leaders and Institutions 111
- 3.3. (Dis)Belief in Excuses for Nonpayment and Attributing Blame 112
- 3.4. Interest in Politics and Political Knowledge 119
- 3.5. Effects on Specificity in Blame Attribution (Predicted Probabilities) 127
- 4.1. Effects of Blame Attribution on Protest (Predicted Probabilities) 140
- 4.2. Support for Subsidies and Protest Activities 148
- 4.3. Support for Free/Controlled Prices and Protest Activities 149
- 4.4. Reciprocal Effects of Blame Attribution and Protest (March 1997) (Structural Equation Model) 156
- 4.5. Reciprocal Effects of Blame Attribution and Protest (April 1998) (Structural Equation Model) 157
- 4.6. Reciprocal Effects of Blame Attribution and Protest (Three Years) (Structural Equation Model) 158
- 5.1. Number of Nonwage Benefits Received by Working Russians 167
- 5.2. Nonwage Benefits and Protest Activities 169
- 5.3. Housing Benefits and Protest Activities 171
- 5.4. Management Attempts to Thwart Protest 172
- 5.5. Fear of Job Loss and Protest Activities 173
- 5.6. Second Income and Protest Activities 178
- 5.7. Payment in Kind and Protest Activities 181
- 5.8. Efficacy and Protest Activities 183
- 5.9. Information and Protest Activities 188

- 5.10. Strategic Importance of Job (Objectively Defined) and Protest Activities 190
- 5.11. Strategic Importance of Job (Subjectively Defined) and Protest Activities 192
- 5.12. Confidence in Russian Organizations 200
- 5.13. Trade Unions and Protest Activities 203
- 5.14. Trade Union Attempts to Mobilize Russians 204
- 5.15. Trade Union Attempts to Thwart Protest Activities 205
- 5.16. Communist Party Attempts to Mobilize Russians 208
- 5.17. Party Preferences and Protest Activities 209
- 5.18. Interest in Politics and Protest Activities 214
- 5.19. Partisan Sympathies and Protest Activities 215
- 5.20. Effects of Blame Attribution on Protest—Expanded Model (Predicted Probabilities) 219

Tables

- I.1. Wage Arrears and Poverty 5
- 1.1. Strikes in Russia 36
- 3.1. Blame for Causing the “Nonpayments” Problem 104
- 3.2. Sources of Wage Debt 107
- 3.3. Number Called “Very Guilty” for Causing Nonpayments 109
- 3.4. (Dis)Belief in Excuses for Nonpayment 111
- 3.5. Inconsistency in Assigning Blame 113
- 3.6. Education and Specificity in Blame Attribution 122
- 3.7. Trade Unions and Specificity in Blame Attribution 124
- 3.8. Explaining Specificity in Blame Attribution (Ordered Logit Estimates) 126
- 4.1. Participation in Protest Activities 130
- 4.2. Wage Arrears and Protest Activities 132
- 4.3. Blame Attribution and Protest Activities 134
- 4.4. Blame Attribution and Protest Activities (More Restrictive Criteria) 135
- 4.5. Effects of Blame Attribution on Protest (Logit Estimates) 138
- 4.6. Effects of the Ability to Attribute Treatment Responsibility on Protest (Logit Estimates) 145
- 5.1. Alternative Job Prospects 164
- 5.2. Wage Arrears and Nonwage Benefits 166
- 5.3. Regularity of Payment of Nonwage Benefits in Past Six Months 168
- 5.4. Surviving without Pay 176
- 5.5. Wage Arrears and Homegrown Food 176
- 5.6. Wage Arrears and Wage Substitutes 180
- 5.7. Information and Efficacy 187
- 5.8. Number of Workers and Protest Activities 213
- 5.9. Effects of Blame Attribution on Protest—Expanded Model (Logit Estimates) 216
- 5.10. Effects of Blame Attribution of Treatment Responsibility on Protest—Expanded Model (Logit Estimates) 221

Acknowledgments

Four institutions were indispensable in bringing this book to fruition. First, I thank the Office of Research at the U.S. State Department (formerly the U.S. Information Agency). I collected the data during my time as a social science research analyst with the office, and I benefited tremendously from the supportive and energetic leadership of Steven Grant, Ann Pincus, and Stephen Shaffer. I also benefited from the collegiality and helpful input of the other analysts, notably Richard Dobson, David Nolle, and Anatole Shub.

I drafted the manuscript during my year as a postdoctoral fellow at the Davis Center for Russian Studies at Harvard University. I thank Timothy Colton and all the affiliates of the center for affording me an intellectually vibrant and flexible environment.

I made major revisions to the manuscript during my year as a postdoctoral fellow at the Institute of Behavioral Science at the University of Colorado, Boulder. Thanks especially to Ed Greenberg and John O'Loughlin for a very rewarding year as well as to the political science department for its hospitality and inclusiveness.

I completed the book as I began my assistant professorship in the political science department at Rice University. Not only has Rice provided a welcoming and comfortable environment, but the department contributed to the book's development by generously assisting in the organization of a small conference to discuss the final draft. In particular, I thank John Ambler, Kevin Arceneaux, David Brown, Lisa Klein, Cliff Morgan, Bob Stein, Randy Stevenson, and Rick Wilson as well as Ann Mikus and Carolyn Zerda for their administrative support. Cliff, Randy, and Rick deserve special mention for doing double and triple tours of duty. I am fortunate to have such thoughtful and helpful colleagues.

Several other individuals read chapters and full drafts of the manuscript. Their input was invaluable. Tami Buhr, Linda Cook, and Brian Silver provided a regular stream of useful advice throughout the book's evolution. Mike McFaul gave the manuscript an especially careful reading

and offered much constructive criticism that shaped my approach to the final draft. Donna Bahry and Guy Whitten graciously came to Rice to participate in the conference and offered thoughtful comments, as did Phil Roeder and Mark Lichbach from afar. Mark Beissinger, Tim Colton, Michael Hiscox, Gary King, Jeff Kopstein, John O'Loughlin, Sam Popkin, Peter Rutland, Jodi Simons, Sid Tarrow, and Jonathon Weiler gave helpful feedback at various stages, and Vanessa Baird and Jeff Hayes provided ever-cheerful and helpful technical advice. I thank them all.

Several individuals contributed to my knowledge of both protest and labor conditions in Russia. Fred Weir, Serge Schmemmann, and other journalists who prefer to remain anonymous were kind enough to offer me their perspectives on media coverage of protest in Russia. I also benefited from the tremendous efforts of David Johnson, the staff of Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty, and the staff of the *Jamestown Foundation Monitor*, who provide a steady flow of information from the widest variety of sources on contemporary Russia.

My apologies go to the subjects of this book, Russians who have suffered from unpaid wages and other economic hardships. The question driving the book is why most Russians have not protested over their hardships. The more burning question from a humanitarian perspective is how to eliminate their hardships so no cause for protest exists. How can Russians ensure that they will receive regular full salaries for their labor, and how can they ensure that economic reforms will not leave them destitute? Most unpaid Russians would probably prefer guidance to observation, and I am sorry that such guidance is outside the scope of this study and beyond my capacity.

I also apologize for the somewhat gloom-and-doom tone of the book. I recognize that a more optimistic introduction and a more optimistic conclusion would please both the Russians involved and U.S. and other audiences. Although I believe the tone accurately characterizes the state of affairs in Russia, I will be happy if proven wrong.

This book was written during training for the 1999 Chicago Marathon and was revised and finished during training for a variety of other running and cycling events. In Boston, Boulder, and Houston, I found great company in my many running and cycling partners, and I thank them for the fun distraction. In particular, I thank the energetic members of the now-defunct Boston Running Club, the coaching staff of TRACS, Community Running, the collegiate national champion Triathlon Team of the University of Colorado, the Boulder Road Runners, the Bayou City Road Run-

ners, the Kenyan Way, and Houston Fit. I have probably logged the most miles with Jack Devine, Jackie Schafer, and Carlos Garcia, and they have my deepest appreciation.

My appreciation and admiration also go to some individuals who have been mentors, cheerleaders, and friends, not just during the writing of this book but before it began and I trust ever after. Tom Gleason and Pat Herlihy introduced me to the study of Russia at Brown University many moons ago, and I prize their gift for teaching and research and their boundless support for their students. Jim O'Leary is a gem of a person and a constant source of good cheer. His approach to life is an inspiration. Finally, Jill Gerber is more a sister than friend. I cherish her intelligence and humor and the bond we share.

I am blessed to have the constant support and encouragement of my family, which I love with all my heart: Barbara Javeline; Anna Goldberg; Brian, Kerri, Taylor, and Jennifer Javeline; and Jodi, Clayton, and Hailey Simons. Wild dogs couldn't tear us apart.